

FINAL  
EVALUATION

**KSV/015**

Support to vocational Education and  
Training Reform in Kosovo

**PROJECT SUMMARY DATA**

Country	The Republic of Kosovo
Long project title	Support to Vocational Education and Training Reform in Kosovo: Establishment of Centres of Competence in Ferizaj and Prizren
Short project title	Support to Vocational, Educational and Training Reform in Kosovo
LuxDev Code	KSV/015
Version of the Report	February 2017

**RATING OF THE PROJECT BY THE EVALUATION MISSION**

Global rating (Effectiveness)	<b>3</b> On a scale of 1 (excellent results, significantly better than expected) to 6 (the project was unsuccessful, or the situation has deteriorated on balance)
Rating using other evaluation criteria	Relevance: <b>1</b> Efficiency: <b>2</b> Sustainability: <b>4</b>

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

### Framework of the mission

The KSV/015 Government of Kosovo was initiated in 2010 as a four-year project with the aim of contributing to economic growth through the modernisation of the education system in Kosovo.

After the four-year project period, the project was extended up to the end of 2016. The budget from the Government of Luxembourg was 8 million EUR for the first four years and national contributions 3 633 600 EUR. This was extended with additional 2 million EUR from Luxembourg for another two years. In November 2016, it was decided to extend the project with one more year, i.e. up to the end of 2017, with no additional costs.

The project is part of an agreement between Luxembourg and Kosovo to fight against poverty. Hence, the project contributes to satisfy the basic needs of the most vulnerable parts of the population. The extension of the project was formulated in the Government of Kosovo Extension Document (2014), which was prepared within the framework of the original Government of Kosovo Document in 2010 and the Inception Report (2011).

A Mid-Term Evaluation of the KSV/015 Government of Kosovo was carried out by mid 2013. This Final Evaluation Report primarily deals with developments that have taken place after the Mid-Term Evaluation. The report follows the structure defined in the Terms of Reference and is based on a desk review of project documents as well as on a field visit to Kosovo from 5 to 16 December 2016.

The Final Evaluation Mission was carried out by PEM Consult Denmark (Hans Henrik Madsen, International Consultant and Team Leader, and Alban Hashani, National Vocational, Educational and Training Expert).

### Objectives and results achieved

The development objective of the project is to contribute to economic growth through the modernisation of the education system in Kosovo. The project's specific objective is to implement the vocational, education and training reform in two Centres of Competence in Kosovo to improve the attractiveness and quality of Vocational, Educational and Training and increase the number of qualified young people entering the labour market. Hence, the objective is to make the Vocational, Educational and Training reform "operational" in Centres of Competence Ferizaj, within the social and health sector, and in Centres of Competence Prizren, within the economic, trade and tourism sector.

The Mission's main objective is to undertake a final evaluation of the KSV/015 Government of Kosovo for LuxDev.

The KSV/015 Government of Kosovo was formulated with two results and seven tasks as shown in Box 1.

#### **Box 1: Results and tasks of the KSV/015 Government of Kosovo**

Result No. 1: Curricula and the respective training and didactic material revised and developed for the two Centres of Competences in line with the need of the labour market and linked to the emerging National Qualification Framework

Task 1: Curriculum update and new curricula with supporting teaching materials development for the Centres of Competence in Ferizaj

Task 2: Curriculum update and new curricula with supporting teaching materials development for the Centres of Competence in Prizren

Task 3: Strengthening the capacity of existing and new teachers and trainers at two Centres of Competences to deliver quality training appropriate to the needs of the sector and industry

Result No. 2: Two Centres of Competences in Ferizaj and Prizren built, equipped and operational

Task 4: Construction and equipment of Centres of Competence in Ferizaj

Task 5: Construction and equipment of Centres of Competence in Prizren

Task 6: Capacity Building in the Centres of Competences in Ferizaj and Prizren

Task 7: Income Generating Activities

## Results achieved

Presently nine profiles are implemented in Ferizaj with 456 students in three grades. 192 students graduated in eight profiles in the academic year 2015-2016. In Prizren, seven profiles are implemented with 472 students. Up to now no students have graduated from Prizren. 13 profiles were originally planned. However, as there was overlap with profiles with the other economic Vocational, Educational and Training school in Prizren, it was decided not to implement these overlapping profiles in order to avoid local competition.

Curricula and training and learning materials are developed in all profiles and it is expected that all targets concerning curricula development and development of training and learning material will be achieved by the end of 2017. All teachers at both Centres of Competences have been recruited and an extensive programme for training of the teachers, many of whom had no teaching experience when employed, have been carried out. An impressive capacity building system for the two Centres of Competences has been introduced. An initiative has been taken to upgrade curricula, training materials and teacher training to an international standard through a partnership with Pearson International (UK) leading to the accreditation of the Centres of Competences as Business and Technology Education Council Qualifications providers at international level.

All construction work of the two Centres of Competences is now finalized (some work is on-going concerning offices related to the business model), and furniture and equipment has been procured and installed<sup>1</sup>. As a result, the two Centres of Competences appear as very attractive and modern training institutions.

Few income-generating activities have been implemented in the two Centres of Competences up to now. Presently, the legal framework of the Centres of Competence is not conducive for establishing income-generating activities.

Presently, the KSV/015 Government of Kosovo office has initiated a significant number of activities that will improve the performance of the two Centres of Competences (and may also at a later stage be replicated by other Vocational, Educational and Training schools). These initiatives include the partnership agreement with Pearson on internationalizing the qualifications of the profiles, establishment of Business Model Offices in both Centres of Competences comprising career guidance, liaison with industry, and information and data management system. Several private-public partnership arrangements are active or being implemented among others with Ottobock Adria, Gears-up Solutions, SES Germany, Heimerer Akademie, Dani, and Almakos. So far, 42 Memorandums of Understanding are signed and active with private enterprises to provide practice placements for students. An effective Monitoring and Evaluation system has been developed and is in use in the two Centres of Competences.

## Evaluation Scores

Evaluation scores using the Development Aid Committee criteria are assessed as follows<sup>2</sup>: Global rating 3, relevance 1, efficiency 2 and sustainability 4.

The relevance of the project is assessed – like in the Mid-Term Evaluation - to be very high. The two Centres of Competences are in line with Government of Kosovo's strategy for development of the Vocational, Educational and Training sector and have the potential to fulfil the objective of the Centres of Competence concept. This will require that the legal and financial framework are adjusted as originally envisaged in the Government of Kosovo Document and highlighted in the Extension Government of Kosovo Document. The score 1 is given on the assumption that these adjustments will take place soon as planned in the Kosovo Education Strategy Plan 2017 – 2021.

---

<sup>1</sup> The final handing over of the buildings to Ministry of Education, Science and Technology from the construction companies have not yet been finalized.

<sup>2</sup> On a scale of six, 1 is excellent results, significantly better than expected; 2 is above average results, performance in certain areas better than expected; 3 is expected results but there is scope for improvement; 4 is below average results, clear need for improvement; 5 is red flagged, the Government of Kosovo needs to be urgently reviewed / restructured; and 6 indicates that the Government of Kosovo was unsuccessful, or the situation has deteriorated on balance.

The efficiency of project implementation has generally been good. Especially during the last year, a good momentum has been seen. In the Mid-Term Evaluation sustainability was assessed to score 3. It was however expected that a more robust strategy for financing the Vocational, Educational and Training schools in general and the two Centres of Competences in particular would be in place at this point of time. This is not the case although important steps to delegate more financial and managerial responsibility to the Centres of Competences have been taken. This may improve the financial sustainability of the two Centres of Competences in the short term. However, an overall robust national strategy for financing the Vocational, Educational and Training schools in the longer term is not in place.

The Final Evaluation Mission therefore assesses that the global rating of the project is 3 – indicating that expected results will be achieved, but there is scope for improvement especially concerning financial sustainability.

## **Main conclusions**

The institutional framework and the Government of Kosovo's strategy for reforming the Vocational, Educational and Training sector have changed since the project inception. Major changes are that the Agency for Vocational Education, Training and Adult Education has been established. The previous authority of the municipalities to manage the Centres of Competences (in collaboration with Ministry of Education, Science and Technology) has been transferred to Agency for Vocational Education, Educational and Training and Adult Education. Although some uncertainties especially concerning decentralization and the future role of the Agency for Vocational Education, Educational and Training and Adult Education exist, the two Centres of Competences could play an important role in implementing the Vocational, Educational and Training reform as defined in the new Kosovo Education Strategy Plan 2017 – 2021.

The Final Evaluation Mission assesses that all "hard" components of the project have been achieved, while some "soft" components have been delayed and there is a risk that these will not be fully achieved. This comprises issues related to the operation of the two Centres of Competences especially autonomy of the Centres of Competences. Much emphasis has been put on capacity strengthening of Centres of Competence staff, and more capacity development, especially to management, is planned for 2017.

According to Government of Kosovo's strategy, the Centres of Competences should serve as 'pilots' of Vocational, Educational and Training reform for the other Vocational, Educational and Training schools in Kosovo. They should also serve as a 'point of counselling and training provision' for employment related services in their respective sectors. The intention is for the Centres of Competences to work closely with sector related businesses to develop hands-on and 'work-based' learning opportunities for Vocational, Educational and Training learners, but also in-house training supply and Life-Long Learning provision for businesses. In addition, the Centres of Competences were also foreseen to provide training and advisory services in their sector for civil society. The two Centres of Competences are well suited for fulfilling these intentions. Especially the Centres of Competence in Ferizaj has the potential to become a country-wide or even a regional training and innovation centre for several profiles. Important steps have been taken to fulfil these functions, but there is still a way to go.

A comprehensive Monitoring and Evaluation system has been developed for the two Centres of Competences. The Monitoring and Evaluation system is an excellent management tool for the two Centres of Competences – if properly updated. The Monitoring and Evaluation system comprises 10 indicators. For each indicator, a comprehensive Indicator Identity Sheet has been designed including practical tools and guidelines for implementation. The data collection, aggregation and calculation have started for each Centres of Competence and provide overview of relevant issues related to an effective management of the Centres of Competences.

Financial sustainability of the Centres of Competences has been discussed from the outset of the project. On several occasions this issue has been discussed at Steering Committee meetings. Presently, the Centres of Competences are mainly financed through the state budget covering staff salaries and a fixed amount of 23 EUR per student per year for consumables<sup>3</sup>. Up to now, additional expenditure including consumables of the two Centres of Competences, has been covered by LuxDev. The opportunities for income generating activities at Centres of Competence level are present, and

---

<sup>3</sup> Ministry of Education, Science and Technology has provided special allocations to the two Centres of Competences (as one-off payments, rather than structured and continuous support).

they should be exploited. However, financial sustainability is not realistic unless the legal framework and the financial formula are adjusted and additional income is generated. In the long run, financial sustainability of Vocational, Educational and Training Schools is only possible if more robust national financing mechanisms are in place.

A significant demand for qualified graduates was found from all profiles in the economic, trade and tourism sector. The situation is more blurred within the social and health sector. There may be a significant potential demand in several profiles, but jobs may only be available in Kosovo in the medium to longer term when more businesses have been established. In several profiles job opportunities are significant outside Kosovo.

The Government of Kosovo and Government of Luxembourg have agreed that support from Luxembourg to the Vocational, Educational and Training sector will continue after the KSV/015 Government of Kosovo will come to an end in 2017.

### **Main recommendations**

Government of Kosovo should re-confirm the purpose of the Centres of Competence concept and ensure that all conditions for implementing this concept are in place. The two Centres of Competences should not only function as traditional Vocational, Educational and Training schools, but also provide services to other Vocational, Educational and Training schools in their respective sector, upgrade new and existing staff of enterprises and function as innovation centres as designed. This will require that the two Centres of Competences are given full autonomy. The legal framework should be adjusted and additional measures undertaken to assist the Centres of Competences become financially, organizationally and pedagogically sustainable. The present financial formula for Vocational, Educational and Training schools should not apply for Centres of Competences. A new financial formula for Centres of Competences should be approved by Government of Kosovo<sup>4</sup>. The KSV/015 Government of Kosovo should provide necessary support to Government of Kosovo to make these changes. This should be reflected in the project budget for 2017.

The Centres of Competence Ferizaj should become a regional school preparing competitive students for the global market. This would attract students from the region. This will require in the longer run that dormitory facilities are established.

Preparation of the new Luxembourg financed project related to the Vocational, Educational and Training sector in Kosovo should start soon and take its point of departure in the experiences drawn from the KSV/015 Government of Kosovo and build on consolidating the results achieved including the full implementation of the Centres of Competence concept. Additional ideas could comprise:

- Mapping and optimization of the Vocational, Educational and Training network. Based on this an overall plan for the future Vocational, Educational and Training landscape in Kosovo could be prepared;
- Establishment of a Vocational, Educational and Training Development fund providing financial support to Vocational, Educational and Training schools that – together with the private sector – have innovative ideas for improving the performance of the Vocational, Educational and Training schools. The support should be provided on a demand-oriented basis. This was also proposed in the Mid-Term Evaluation. The private sector should be heavily involved in governing such a fund;
- Assisting Ministry of Education, Science and Technology and Agency for Vocational Education, Training and Adult Education to increase their capacity to oversee such a programme. Support could also be considered to business associations involved in Centres of Competences.

---

<sup>4</sup> At this point of time the Government of Kosovo has contracted a consultant to prepare a proposal for reform of the financial management of the Centres of Competences including annual costing and needs estimation.